

The Honorable Ricardo S. Martinez
The Honorable David W. Christel

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

NYLYSHA STARVION BELAFON
ARADON, CAREY ALLEN HAYES,
A.H., a minor, A.L., a minor,

Plaintiff,

v.

SNOHOMISH COUNTY and its
SNOHOMISH COUNTY SUPERIOR
COURT, and the SNOHOMISH
COUNTY VOLUNTEER GUARDIAN
AD LITEM PROGRAM; SUSAN
WALKER and JOHN DOE WALKER,
individually and the marital community;
KIRSTEN HAUGEN and JOHN DOE
HAUGEN, individually and the marital
community; and, SARA DI VITTORIO
and JOHN DOE DI VITTORIO,
individually and the martial community,

Defendant.

CASE NO. 2:20-CV-01665-RSM-
DWC

**STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

NOTED FOR: MARCH 15, 2022

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket

1 protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public
 2 disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential
 3 treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file
 4 confidential information under seal.

5 2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL

6 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things
 7 produced or otherwise exchanged: court files, health care records, counseling records, educational
 8 records, and DSHS/DCYF records in the dependency matter when it was venued in Snohomish
 9 County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 14-7-00499-7 and now venued in
 10 King County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 20-7-00809-3 SEA, including
 11 any files in the possession of the parties related to the above dependency matter. No documents
 12 designated as “confidential” may be disclosed unless as provided in this stipulated protective order.

13 3. SCOPE

14 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as
 15 defined above), but also: (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2)
 16 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
 17 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

18 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
 19 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

20 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

21 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
 22 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
 23 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the
 24 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material
 25 must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures
 26 that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

1 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
2 by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any
3 confidential material only to:

4 (a) counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of counsel to whom it
5 is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

6 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
7 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
8 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney’s Eyes Only and is so
9 designated;

10 (c) experts, consultants, and parties, including A.H.’s Guardian ad Litem, GAL
11 Jo-Hanna Read, to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
12 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

13 (d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

14 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of
15 confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
16 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
17 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

18 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
19 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
20 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of
21 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must
22 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
23 under this agreement;

24 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
25 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.
26

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

The parties shall meet and confer before filing any materials related to the King County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 20-7-00809-3 SEA. No parties shall file or identify in court filings any documents relating to the ongoing King County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 20-7-00809-3 SEA unless all parties consent. Plaintiffs may confer with GAL Jo-Hanna Read prior to consenting or declining to consent to the filing of documents referenced in this paragraph. The parties shall follow the procedures and standards set forth in Local Civil Rule 5(g) and seek permission from the court to file under seal any materials or pleadings related to King County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 20-7-00809-3 SEA.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate

standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

Subject to the provisions in paragraph 5.1, A.H.'s GAL, GAL Jo-Hanna Read, may designate as confidential files related to the ongoing King County Superior Court, *Dependency of A.E.T.H.*, Cause No. 20-7-00809-3 SEA. (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony

1 after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving the
 2 transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or
 3 exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information
 4 at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

5 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place
 6 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word
 7 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
 8 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

9 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
 10 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s
 11 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
 12 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
 13 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

14 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

15 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
 16 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party’s confidentiality
 17 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
 18 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
 19 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
 20 original designation is disclosed.

21 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
 22 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential
 23 designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration
 24 or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other
 25 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
 26

1 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
2 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

3 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
4 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local
5 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of
6 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those
7 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
8 other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain
9 the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

10 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
11 LITIGATION

12 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
13 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party
14 must:

15 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the
16 subpoena or court order;

17 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
18 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is
19 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

20 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by
21 the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

22 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential
24 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving
25 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures,
26 (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the

person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: March 15, 2022

/s/Patrick Trudell

Patrick A. Trudell, WSBA #11363

Scott Bowen, WSBA #10605

Attorneys for Plaintiffs
KORNFELD TRUDELL BOWEN &
LINGENBRINK, PLLC
3724 Lake Washington Blvd NE
Kirkland, WA 98033
Phone: 425-822-2200
Fax: 425-822-0783
Email: patrick@ktbllaw.com;
scott@ktbllaw.com

/s/ Michael E. Withey
Michael E. Withey, WSBA #4787
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
LAW OFFICE OF MICHAEL WITHEY
528 33rd Ave S
Seattle, WA 98144-254
Phone: 206-999-8308
Email: mike@witheyllaw.com

/s/ Kristofer J. Bundy
Kristofer J. Bundy, WSBA #19840
Special Deputy Prosecuting Attorney
Attorney for Defendant Kristen Haugen
BUNDY LAW GROUP
P.O. Box 2543
Bellingham, WA 98227
Direct: 206.372.3627
Email: kris@bundylawgroup.com

/s/ Allison Croft
Allison Croft, WSBA #30486
Attorney for Defendant Susan Walker
SIMMONS SWEENEY FREIMUND
SMITH TARDIF, PLLC
711 Capitol Way S Ste 602
Olympia, WA 98501-1236
Phone: (360) 534-9960
Email: Allison@ftlawoffice.com

/s/ Shannon M. Ragonesi
Shannon M. Ragonesi, WSBA #31851

/s/ Audrey M. Airut Murphy
Audrey M. Airut Murphy, WSBA #56833

Attorneys for Snohomish County, Sara Di
Vittorio, and John Doe Di Vittorio
KEATING, BUCKLIN & MCCORMACK,
INC., P.S.
801 Second Avenue, Suite 1210
Seattle, WA 98104
Phone: (206) 623-8861
Email: Sragonesi@kbmlawyers.com
Email: Amurphy@kbmlawyers.com

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

2 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
3 documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or
4 state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those
5 documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other
6 privilege or protection recognized by law.

7
8 DATED this 17th day of March, 2022.
9

10 

11 David W. Christel
12 United States Magistrate Judge
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of
perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on ____ [date]
in the case of:

NYLYSHA STARVION BELAFON ARADON, et al., v. SNOHOMISH COUNTY, et al.
Cause No. 2:20-CV-1665-RSM-DWC.

I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order
and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and
punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity
except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____